

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
MIDDLE DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE  
NASHVILLE DIVISION

IN RE: REALPAGE, INC., RENTAL ) Case No. 3:23-md-3071  
SOFTWARE ANTITRUST LITIGATION ) MDL No. 3071  
(NO. II) )  
 ) Chief Judge Waverly D.  
 ) Crenshaw, Jr.  
 )  
 ) JURY DEMAND  
 )  
 ) This Document Relates to:  
 ) 3:23-cv-00330  
 ) 3:23-cv-00333  
 ) 3:23-cv-00337  
 ) 3:23-cv-00339  
 ) 3:23-cv-00387  
 ) 3:23-cv-00389  
 ) 3:23-cv-00414

**PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANT BH'S AND DEFENDANT CH'S  
MOTIONS TO DISMISS FOR LACK OF PERSONAL JURISDICTION**

On July 6, 2023, certain parties moved the Court to enter a stipulation and order “deferring the issue of personal jurisdiction and venue for 180 days.” Dkt. 317 (“Deferral Motion”). On July 7, 2023, two Defendants that did not join the Deferral Motion, BH Management Services, LLC (“BH”), and CH Real Estate Services, LLC (“CH”), filed motions to dismiss for a lack of personal jurisdiction in the transferor court(s). *See* Dkts. 326, 327, respectively (collectively, “PJ MTDs”).

On July 24, 2023, Plaintiffs filed *Kabisch v. RealPage, Inc. et al.* in this District. *See* Complaint, *Kabisch v. RealPage, Inc., et al.*, (M.D. Tenn.) (filed concurrently on this date) (hereinafter, “*Kabisch*”). *Kabisch* names BH and CH as defendants, and includes allegations that BH owns or operates “five properties in the Greater Nashville Metro Area.” *Kabisch* ¶ 44. *Kabisch* also includes allegations that CH is headquartered in Nashville, Tennessee. *Kabisch* ¶ 48. Thus, personal jurisdiction is established in this district by virtue of BH and CH’s contacts with

Tennessee. *See Bristol-Myers Squibb Co. v. Superior Ct. of Cal., San Francisco Cnty.*, 582 U.S. 255, 264 (2017) (personal jurisdiction proper based on “affiliation between the forum and the underlying controversy, principally, an activity or an occurrence [related to the controversy] that takes place in the forum State”); *Canaday v. Anthem Cos., Inc.*, 9 F.4th 392, 396 (6th Cir. 2021) (personal jurisdiction proper in federal court sitting in state “where the defendant is incorporated or headquartered”). On the civil cover sheet, Plaintiffs identified that *Kabisch* is related to this multidistrict litigation (“MDL”). *See Civil Cover Sheet, Kabisch v. RealPage, Inc., et al.*, (M.D. Tenn.) (filed concurrently on this date). Once *Kabisch v. RealPage* is administratively transferred to this Court and added to the MDL docket, Plaintiffs intend to dismiss both BH and CH from the constituent complaints at issue in their respective motions without prejudice, with the class action claims against BH and CH to be instead litigated under the *Kabisch* complaint. *See* Dkts. 326,<sup>1</sup> 327.<sup>2</sup>

At the conclusion of the above course of events, which Plaintiffs expect to occur in the coming days, (1) neither BH nor CH will be named as a defendant in any case where either has contested personal jurisdiction; and (2) this Court will have personal jurisdiction over BH and CH in this MDL pursuant to the allegations contained in *Kabisch*.

Accordingly, Plaintiffs respectfully request that this Court deny the PJ MTDs as moot.

---

<sup>1</sup> BH’s motion pertains to the following constituent cases: 3:23-cv-00330 (M.D. Tenn.); 3:23-cv-00333 (M.D. Tenn.); 3:23-cv-00337 (M.D. Tenn.); 3:23-cv-00339 (M.D. Tenn.); 3:23-cv-00387 (M.D. Tenn.); 3:23-cv-00389 (M.D. Tenn.); and 3:23-cv-00414 (M.D. Tenn.).

<sup>2</sup> CH’s motion pertains to the constituent case 3:23-cv-00333 (M.D. Tenn.).

Dated: July 24, 2023

*/s/ Tricia R. Herzfeld*

---

Tricia R. Herzfeld (#26014)

Anthony A. Orlandi (#33988)

**HERZFELD SUETHOLZ GASTEL LENISKI  
AND WALL, PLLC**

223 Rosa L. Parks Avenue, Suite 300

Nashville, TN 37203

Telephone: (615) 800-6225

tricia@hsglawgroup.com

tony@hsglawgroup.com

*Liaison Counsel*

Patrick J. Coughlin

Carmen A. Medici

Fatima Brizuela

**SCOTT+SCOTT ATTORNEYS AT LAW LLP**

600 West Broadway, Suite 3300

San Diego, CA 92101

Telephone: (619) 798-5325

Facsimile: (619) 233-0508

pcoughlin@scott-scott.com

cmedici@scott-scott.com

fbrizuela@scott-scott.com

Patrick McGahan

Amanda F. Lawrence

Michael Srodoski

G. Dustin Foster

Isabella De Lisi

**SCOTT+SCOTT ATTORNEYS AT LAW LLP**

156 South Main Street

P.O. Box 192

Colchester, CT 06145

Telephone: (860) 537-5537

Facsimile: (860) 537-4432

pmcgahan@scott-scott.com

alawrence@scott-scott.com

msrodoski@scott-scott.com

gfoster@scott-scott.com

idelisi@scott-scott.com

Stacey Slaughter

Thomas J. Undlin

Geoffrey H. Kozen

Stephanie A. Chen

J. Austin Hurt  
**ROBINS KAPLAN LLP**  
800 LaSalle Avenue, Suite 2800  
Minneapolis, MN 55402  
Telephone: (612) 349-8500  
Facsimile: (612) 339-4181  
[sslaughter@robinskaplan.com](mailto:sslaughter@robinskaplan.com)  
[tundlin@robinskaplan.com](mailto:tundlin@robinskaplan.com)  
[gkozen@robinskaplan.com](mailto:gkozen@robinskaplan.com)  
[schen@robinskaplan.com](mailto:schen@robinskaplan.com)  
[ahurt@robinskaplan.com](mailto:ahurt@robinskaplan.com)

Swathi Bojedla  
Mandy Boltax  
**HAUSFELD LLP**  
888 16<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W., Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: (202) 540-7200  
[sbojedla@hausfeld.com](mailto:sbojedla@hausfeld.com)  
[mboltax@hausfeld.com](mailto:mboltax@hausfeld.com)

Gary I. Smith, Jr.  
**HAUSFELD LLP**  
600 Montgomery Street, Suite 3200  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Tel: (415) 633-1908  
[gsmith@hausfeld.com](mailto:gsmith@hausfeld.com)

Katie R. Beran  
**HAUSFELD LLP**  
325 Chestnut Street, Suite 900  
Philadelphia, PA 19106  
Telephone: 1 215 985 3270  
[kberan@hausfeld.com](mailto:kberan@hausfeld.com)

*Interim Co-Lead Counsel*

Eric L. Cramer  
Michaela L. Wallin  
**BERGER MONTAGUE PC**  
1818 Market Street, Suite 3600  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: (215) 875-3000  
ecramer@bm.net  
mwallin@bm.net

Daniel J. Walker  
**BERGER MONTAGUE PC**  
2001 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Suite  
300  
Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: (202) 559-9745  
dwalker@bm.net

Brendan P. Glackin  
Dean M. Harvey  
**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &  
BERNSTEIN, LLP**  
275 Battery Street, Suite 2900  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: 415-956-1000  
bglackin@lchb.com  
dharvey@lchb.com

Mark P. Chalos  
Hannah R. Lazarz  
Kenneth S. Byrd  
**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &  
BERNSTEIN, LLP**  
222 2nd Avenue South, Ste. 1640  
Nashville, TN 37201  
(615) 313-9000  
mchalos@lchb.com  
hlazarz@lchb.com  
kbyrd@lchb.com

Steve W. Berman  
Breanna Van Engelen  
**HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL  
SHAPIRO LLP**  
1301 Second Avenue, Suite 2000  
Seattle, Washington 98101  
Telephone: (206) 623-7292

Christian P. Levis  
Vincent Briganti  
Peter Demato  
Radhika Gupta  
**LOWEY DANNENBERG, P.C.**  
44 South Broadway, Suite 1100  
White Plains, NY 10601  
Telephone: (914) 997-0500  
Facsimile: (914) 997-0035  
vbriganti@lowey.com  
clevis@lowey.com  
pdemato@lowey.com  
rgupta@lowey.com

Christopher M. Burke  
Walter W. Noss  
Yifan (Kate) Lv  
**KOREIN TILLERY P.C.**  
707 Broadway, Suite 1410  
San Diego, CA 92101  
Telephone: (619) 625-5621  
Facsimile (314) 241-3525  
cburke@koreintillery.com  
wnoss@koreintillery.com  
klv@koreintillery.com

**JOSEPH SAVERI LAW FIRM, LLP**  
Joseph R. Saveri  
Steven N. Williams  
Cadio Zirpoli  
Kevin E. Rayhill  
601 California Street, Suite 1000  
San Francisco, CA 94108  
Telephone: (415) 500-6800  
jsaveri@saverilawfirm.com  
swilliams@saverilawfirm.com  
czirpoli@saverilawfirm.com  
krayhill@saverilawfirm.com

Jennifer W. Sprengel  
Daniel O. Herrera  
Alexander Sweatman  
**CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER &  
SPRENGEL LLP**  
135 S. LaSalle, Suite 3210  
Chicago, IL 60603

Facsimile: (206) 623-0594  
[steve@hbsslaw.com](mailto:steve@hbsslaw.com)  
[breannav@hbsslaw.com](mailto:breannav@hbsslaw.com)

Benjamin J. Widlanski  
Javier A. Lopez  
**KOZYAK TROPIN &  
THROCKMORTON LLP**  
2525 Ponce de Leon Blvd., 9th Floor  
Coral Gables, Florida 33134  
Telephone: (305) 372-1800  
[bwidlanski@kttlaw.com](mailto:bwidlanski@kttlaw.com)  
[jal@kttlaw.com](mailto:jal@kttlaw.com)

Telephone: 312-782-4880  
Facsimile: 312-782-4485  
[jsprengel@caffertyclobes.com](mailto:jsprengel@caffertyclobes.com)  
[dherrera@caffertyclobes.com](mailto:dherrera@caffertyclobes.com)  
[asweatman@caffertyclobes.com](mailto:asweatman@caffertyclobes.com)

*Plaintiffs' Steering Committee Counsel for Plaintiffs*

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on July 24, 2023, I caused the foregoing to be electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to the email addresses denoted on the Electronic Mail Notice List.

*/s/ Tricia R. Herzfeld*  
Tricia R. Herzfeld